BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 04863 3374

RESTITUTION

2002 — 2003

Professor E.J. Weinrib

Faculty of Law

University of Toronto

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
AUG 2 8 2002
FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

RESTITUTION

2002 — 2003

Professor E.J. Weinrib

Faculty of Law

University of Toronto

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/restitution00wein_0

Restitution

I. THE NATURE OF RESTITUTION

Aristotle, Nicomachean Ethics, Book Five 1129a26 - 1132b20,
(Ostwald trans.) 1
Corrective Justice in a Nutshell, Ernest J. Weinrib 6
Edwards v. Lee's Administrator, 96 S.W. (2d) 1028 (Ky. C.A., 1936) 13
Vincent v. Lake Erie Transportation Co. (1910), 124 N.W. 222 (Minn. S.C.) 17
Extract from American Restatement of Restitution (1937),
§ 122. Benefits Derived From the Exercise of Incomplete Privilege 20
Palmer, The Law of Restitution, Volume I, 139-140
(Boston and Toronto: Little, Brown, 1978) 22

II. THE DEVELOPMENT OF RESTITUTION

Moses v. MacFerlan (1760), 97 E.R. 676, 2 Burr. 1005 (K.B.) 23
Dobbs, Handbook on the Law of Remedies, (St. Paul: West, 1973) 229 26
Extract from American Restatement of Restitution (1937) 41
Seavey and Scott, Restitution, (1938) 54 Law Quarterly Review 29,
29-32, 36-39 43
Deglman v. Guaranty Trust Co. and Constantineau, [1954] S.C.R. 725;
[1954] 3 D.L.R. 785 47
Pavey & Matthews Proprietary Ltd. v. Paul (1986) 162 C.L.R. 221
(H.C. Australia) 49
Pettkus v. Becker (1980), 117 D.L.R. (3d) 257 (S.C.C.) 54
Peter v. Beblow (1993), 101 D.L.R. (4th) 621 (S.C.C.) 62
Dublin v. Building and Allied Trade Union [1996] 2 ILRM 547 (S.C.) 72

III. UNREQUESTED BENEFITS

1. Basic Ideas

Taylor v. Laird (1856), 156 E.R. 1203 79
Moule v. Garrett (1872), L.R. 7 Ex. 101 (Ex. Chamber) 80
Brooks Wharf & Bull Wharf, Ltd. v. Goodman Bros., [1936] 3 All E.R. 696 (C.A.) 82
Ruabon Steamship Co. v. London Assurance, [1990] A.C. 6 (H.L.) 85
Jenkins v. Tucker (1788) 126 ER 555 (C.P.) 89
Shallcross v. Wright (1850) 50 E.R. 1174 90
Restatement of Restitution - s. 2 92
Birks, An Introduction to the Law of Restitution (1985) 101-103 93

2. Preserving Another's Property

Nicholson v. Chapman (1793) 126 E.R. 536 (C.P.) 95
Falcke v. Scottish Imperial Insurance Company (1886), 34 Ch. D. 234 97
Great Northern Railway v. Swaffield (1874) L.R. 9 Ex. 132 (Exch.) 103
Prager v. Blatspiel, Stamp and Heacock, [1924] 1 KB 566 (KBD) 106
Jebara v. Ottoman Bank, [1927] 2 KB 254 (C.A.) 108
China Pacific S.A. v. Food Corporation of India (The Winston), [1982] A.C. 939 (H.L.) 109
Restatement of Restitution - s. 117 114

3. Preserving Another's Health

Hastings v. Semans Village, [1946] 4 D.L.R. 695 (Sask. C.A.) 116
Matheson v. Smiley, [1932] 2 D.L.R. 787 (Man. C.A.) 120
Restatement of Restitution - s. 116 122

4. Discharging Another's Liability

Traders Realty Ltd. v. Huron Heights Shopping Plaza Ltd. (1967), 64 D.L.R. (2d) 278 (Ont. S.C.) 124
Owen v. Tate, [1975] 2 All E.R. 129 (C.A.) 127
County of Carleton v. City of Ottawa, [1965] S.C.R. 663 134
Norton v. Haggett (1952), 85 A. 2d 571 (Vt. S.C.) 136

5. Incontrovertible Benefits

Regional Municipality of Peel v. Her Majesty the Queen in right of Canada (1992), 98 D.L.R. (4th) 140 (S.C.C.) 138

IV. MISTAKEN PAYMENTS

1. The Irrelevance of Fault

Kelly v. Solari (1841), 9 M & W 54, 152 E.R. 24 151
Clark v. Eckroyd (1885), 12 O.A.R. 425 153
R.E. Jones v. Waring and Gillow, [1926] A.C. 670 (H.L.) 156

2. The Nature of the Mistake

Aiken v. Short (1856), 1 H. & N. 210, 156 E.R. 1180 160
Birks, An Introduction to the Law of Restitution (1985) 148-154 161

Barclays Bank Ltd. v. W. J. Simms Son & Cooke (Southern) Ltd., [1979] 3 All E.R. 522 (Q.B.) 164
David Securities v. Commonwealth Bank of Australia (1992) 175 C.L.R. 353 (H.C. Australia) 172

Lowe v. Wells Fargo & Co. Express (1908), 96 p. 74 (S.C. of Kansas).....173
Larner v. London County Council, [1949] 1 All E.R. 964 (C.A.).....175
Lady Hood of Avalon v. MacKinnon, [1909] 1 Ch. 476.....177

3. Change of Position

Rural Municipality of Storthoaks v. Mobil Oil Canada Ltd. (1975), 55 D.L.R. (3d) 1 (S.C.C.).....180
Lipkin Gorman v. Karpnale, [1992] 4 All E.R. 512 (H.L.).....182
RBC Dominion Securities Inc. v. Dawson (1994), 111 D.L.R. (4th) 230 (Nfld. C.A.).....194
South Tyneside Metropolitan Borough Council v. Svenska International plc [1995] 1 All E.R. 545 (Q.B.D., Comm. Ct.).....202
Cheese v. Thomas [1994] 1 All E.R. 35 (C.A., Civ. Div.).....209

4. Mistake of Law and Invalid Exactions

Hydro Electric Commission of Nepean Twp. v. Ontario Hydro (1982), 132 D.L.R. (3d) 193 (S.C.C.).....215
Air Canada v. British Columbia (1989), 59 D.L.R. (4th) 161 (S.C.C.).....225
Commissioner of State Revenue (Victoria) v. Royal Insurance Australia Ltd. (1994) 182 C.L.R. 51 (H.C. Australia).....235
Kleinwort Benson v. Birmingham City Council [1994] 4 All E.R. 733 (C.A., Civ. Div.).....240

V. MISTAKEN BENEFITS

Nicholson v. St. Denis (1975), 8 O.R. (2d) 315 (C.A.).....244
Greenwood v. Bennett, [1973] 1 Q.B. 195 (C.A.).....248
Gidney v. Shank [1995] 5 W.W.R. 385 (Man Q.B.).....252
Gidney v. Shank reversed [1996] 2 W.W.R. 383 (Man C.A.).....257
Montreuil v. The Ontario Asphalt Company (1921), 63 S.C.R. 401.....259
LAC Minerals Ltd. v. International Corona Resources Ltd. (1987), 44 D.L.R. (4th) 592 (Ont. C.A.); (1989) 61 D.L.R. (4th) 14 (S.C.C.).....267

VI. BENEFITS CONFERRED UNDER COMPULSION

Astley v. Reynolds (1731), 93 E.R. 939 K.B.....273
Skeate v. Beale (1841), 113 E.R. 688.....274
Knutson v. The Bourkes Syndicate, [1941] S.C.R. 419.....275
Peter Kiewit Sons' Co. of Canada v. Eakins Construction Ltd., [1960] S.C.R. 361.....277
Morton Construction Co. Ltd. v. City of Hamilton, [1962] O.R. 154 (C.A.).....282
Smith v. William Charlick Ltd. (1924) 34 C.L.R. 38 (H.C.).....284

Pao On v. Lau Yiu, [1979] 3 All E.R. 65 (P.C.) 287
Universe Tankships Inc. of Monrovia v. International Transport Workers Federation, [1983] A.C. 366 (H.L.) 293
Thorne v. Motor Trade Association, [1937] A.C. 797 (H.L.) 298
CTN Cash and Carry Ltd. v. Gallaher, [1994] 4 All E.R. 714 301
Eadie v. Township of Brantford, [1967] S.C.R. 523 305

VII. RESTITUTION FOR WRONGS

1. Tortious Wrongs

Lamine v. Dorrell (1701), Ld. Ray. 1216 309
United Australia v. Barclays Bank, [1941] A.C. 1 (H.L.) 310
Phillips v. Homfray (1883), 24 Ch. D. 439 315
Strand Electric and Engineering v. Brisford Entertainments, [1952] 2 Q.B. 246 (C.A.) 319
Olwell v. Nye and Nissen, 173 P. 2d 652 (Wash. S.C., 1946) 324

2. Breaches of Fiduciary Obligation

Reading v. Attorney General, [1951] A.C. 507 (H.L.) 327
Attorney-General for Hong Kong v. Reid, [1994] 1 A.C. 324 (P.C.) 332

3. Breaches of Contract

British Motor Trade Association v. Gilbert, [1951] 2 All E.R. (641) Ch.D.) 341
New Orleans v. Firemen's Charitable Association, 9 SO. 486 (La S.C., 1891) 343
Adras Building Materials v. Harlow & Jones, February 11, 1988 (Supreme Court of Israel); [1995] Restitution Law Review 235 344
Attorney General v. Blake [2000] 4 All E.R. 385 (H.L.) 353